Switchbacks: Art, Ownership, and Nuxalk National Identity

McGarry, Karen

Anthropologica; 2008; 50, 1; ProQuest Central

pg. 176

guided by legislative and legal needs" (p. 77). Through a discussion of what he calls "not so common" anthropological examples, Boxberger illustrates how the needs of the dominant society influenced anthropological research and its presentation and use in political and legal contexts, and as a result, how those needs were imposed on Coast Salish peoples. His knowledge and background as an expert witness are invaluable and should appeal to those working within the political and legal systems. Brent Galloway's chapter, while weak, provides an interesting and fairly descriptive overview of the development, background and setup of the language programs among the Nooksack Tribe and the Stó:lō Nation that would be of general appeal to those interested or working in language revival and revitalization.

David Schaepe's chapter, centres around the Stó:lō Nation Heritage Policy and their Heritage Resource Management Plan, from an archaeological perspective; a plan that he, with McHalsie, helped develop. This chapter provides a nice compliment to Carlson's contribution, as both focus on the issue of identity. Schaepe is concerned with more recent history but also with the connection between landscape, resource management, and identity-situating this nexus within contemporary political and cultural survival contexts. The other archaeological contribution, by Bill Angelbeck, is also well done and of interest in terms of his discussion of the use of ethnographic record in archaeological interpretations of warfare and pacifism among Coast Salish peoples. This chapter is a nice compliment to Suttles' (1987) arguments not only about pacifism in the region but also about the "recent emergence" hypothesis which portrays Coast Salish peoples as imitative and passive (versus the creative and aggressive Wakashans). The early ethnographic record has been significant in shaping our conceptions of Coast Salish peoples and Angelbeck does a good job at drawing this out.

An interesting absence is that Miller himself does not contribute a chapter other than his introduction. His work (see Miller 2001 for example), more than any of the other contributors, fits the aim of demonstrating the connectedness of the Coast Salish world. A chapter by Miller would have dovetailed nicely with the contributions to this volume and would, perhaps, have provided the necessary concluding chapter tying the book together.

Be of Good Mind serves as an excellent compliment to Mauzé et al. (2004) and balances out the contemporary literature in this region. Perhaps the only "problem" with this book, as discussed by Harmon, is that "Coast Salish" is too narrow a concept.

References

Mauzé, Marie, Michael E. Harkin and Sergei Kan, eds.

2004 Coming to Shore: Northwest Coast Ethnology, Traditions, and Visions. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Miller, Bruce G.

2001 The Problem of Justice: Tradition and Law in the Coast Salish World. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. Miller, Jay 1999

Lushootseed Culture and the Shamanic Odyssey: An Anchored Radiance. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

Suttles, Wayne

1987 Coast Salish Essays. Vancouver: Talonbooks.

Suttles, Wayne, ed.

1990 Handbook of North American Indians, vol. 7. Washington: Smithsonian Institution.

Jennifer Kramer, Switchbacks: Art, Ownership, and Nuxalk National Identity, Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2006, 152 pages.

Reviewer: Karen McGarry Trent University

Renowned by art dealers and museum collectors for its distinctive formal qualities, style and iconography, much of the art produced by Canadian indigenous artists of the Northwest Coast has been sought after and marketed as an "authentic" representation of indigenousness. Indeed, art has historically served as a powerful cultural identity marker (both internally and externally) for several Northwest Coast communities. For indigenous artists, however, the display and consumption of both historical and contemporary art by non-Native audiences is entangled with ambiguous sentiments and shifting discourses surrounding notions of both cultural revival and loss. As such, the production, exchange, commodification, ownership, display, and repatriation of Northwest Coast art have become politically charged and contentious issues.

In Switchbacks: Art, Ownership, and Nuxalk National Identity, anthropologist Jennifer Kramer explores these issues ethnographically among the Nuxalk of Bella Coola, British Columbia. "Switchbacks" is based on 16 months of fieldwork in Bella Coola, where Kramer conducted interviews and participant observation with artists, community elders, educators, chiefs and others involved in the production, distribution and repatriation of Nuxalk art. Inspired by her experience of driving along the treacherous, oftentimes inaccessible road into the Bella Coola Valley, Kramer adopts the metaphor of the "switchback" to refer to Nuxalk tendencies to oscillate between unifying, cohesive discourses of what she terms "strategic essentialism" (p. 50) and more fragmented, heterogeneous narratives in the production of a national identity. There is no definitive Nuxalk stance, for instance, on the commodification of art and her informants readily shift between these two extreme narratives of identity production depending upon context. At times, many Nuxalk declare that the conscious production and marketing of stereotypically "authentic" and "traditional" art styles for external consumption is necessary to both create and validate a sense of Nuxalk political autonomy on an international stage. In other contexts, however, they espouse a pejorative attitude toward the commodifica-

176 / Book Reviews / Comptes rendus

Anthropologica 50 (2008)

tion of art, arguing that its display, whether in museums or on t-shirts, oftentimes overlooks the heterogeneity of artistic styles which results in the production of a monolithic Nuxalk "Culture" for public consumption. A key goal of Kramer's research, then, is to understand the varied contents within which these oftentimes conflicting discourses are produced and circulated for public consumption.

Analytically, Kramer's ethnography represents a detailed and welcome ethnographic addition to trends since the mid-1980s which privilege an analysis of "the social life of things" (Appadurai 1986; see also Riggins 1994; Vastokas 1992). Many early analyses of Northwest Coast art were principally concerned with form, style, or function, and as such, they unintentionally dehistoricized art from the social lives of indigenous peoples. Early anthropologists like Franz Boas (1898) and Thomas McIllwraith (1966), for example, were primarily concerned with the collection, documentation, and preservation of "traditional" art, and subsequent scholars conducted art historical analyses that centred upon analyses of the formal qualities of art itself. While such studies have some utility, they effectively decontextualized art from its processes of manufacture and use. While there has been a growing trend to study material culture as both socially constitutive and performative, it is still either frequently neglected by ethnographers, or relegated to the domain of archaeology or museum studies. There have been relatively few ethnographic analyses of such phenomena. Kramer's ethnography, however, makes the social lives of objects the central focus of her work. She centres on conflicts surrounding the sale and eventual repatriation of two historically significant and sacred Nuxalk masks, as well as people's memories and attitudes surrounding the material culture employed in a performance of a potlatch by students at a local school. Kramer follows the varied narratives surrounding both the masks and the potlatch, including the different attitudes of those involved in the various stages of their life histories. This includes discourses about the production, sale, and repatriation of Nuxalk art, as well as the perspectives of non-Native art dealers and consumers. In the process, Kramer employs her ethnographic data to critically challenge the ways in which anthropologists have historically perceived such loaded concepts as "authenticity," "tradition," and "cultural appropriation."

Ultimately, the incorporation of a diversity of perspectives enables Kramer to effectively incorporate a multi-sited approach to her fieldwork. Indeed, one of the major concerns of her ethnography is to situate "local" concerns within a transnational framework. Kramer's strategy of following the life course of objects permits an analysis of how contemporary Nuxalk identities are increasingly constituted through the global flow and positive international reception of Nuxalk art. As she maintains, "I question the commonly held assumption that selling Native art outside its community of origin inherently involves a loss, and, instead, [suggest that] there may be something identity-affirming in having one's cultural objects recognized and valued by outsiders" (p. 88).

Kramer's research makes an important contribution to analyses of the intersections between global flows of commodities and the production of a national identity "at home." At times, Nuxalk "switch" between the production and promotion of self-essentializing and "authentic" stereotypes of identity for public consumption, and more heterogeneous identities for their own benefit. In many ways, the concept of a "traditional," and "authentic" identity—a concept challenged. critiqued, and destabilized within anthropological discoursesbecomes an act of cultural revival and defiance for the Nuxalk. Stereotypes of Nuxalk identity, rooted in seemingly "authentic" artistic designs and styles, are oftentimes consciously promoted to acquire a sense of political legitimacy in the wider world, and thus, as Kramer suggests, it becomes proof of selfautonomy as "market value can reflect cultural value" (p. 65). The Nuxalk are thus not passive victims of globalization, but active agents who have the power to decide what constitutes appropriate content for non-Nuxalk consumption.

Overall, Kramer's ethnography is a well-researched and enjoyable read. It is written in accessible, jargon-free language, which makes it particularly suitable for upper level undergraduate courses on themes such as material culture theory, cultural appropriation, nationalism, indigenoùs art and globalization. Kramer also does an excellent job of contextualizing her work within broader theoretical concerns on exchange theory, and she clearly demonstrates for readers how material culture can play a critical role in the production of national identities.

With that said, I have two very minor critiques of Kramer's work. First, her arguments are oftentimes repetitive and she frequently reiterates the same theoretical presuppositions in multiple contexts. While a reiteration and re-framing of principle arguments throughout a text is often extremely beneficial for student readers, her arguments often become tedious. Second, despite Kramer's extensive fieldwork, her ethnography is often missing the detailed nuances of the actual conversations she had with various informants. Instead, she frequently summarizes the content of interviews and informal discussions in her own words. Much of her writing is thus lacking the rich, animated, and interactive qualities of the fieldwork process, and it would have been beneficial to incorporate more of the actual voices of her informants. Despite this, however, Kramer's work draws attention to the ways in which competing discourses of national identity get constructed, and also to the role of material objects in the formation and presentation of both cohesive and fragmented identity discourses. I highly recommend her work for both anthropology students and researchers interested in issues of material culture and national identity production.

References

Appadurai, Arjun

1986 The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Boas, Franz

1898 The Mythology of the Bella Coola Indians. Memoirs of the American Museum of Natural History 2(1):25-127.

Anthropologica 50 (2008)

Book Reviews / Comptes rendus / 177

McIllwraith, Thomas F.

 The Ancestral Family of the Bella Coola. In Indians of the North Pacific Coast. Tom McFeat, ed. Pp. 58-71.
Seattle and London: University of Washington Press.

Riggins, Stephen H.

1994 The Socialness of Things: Essays on the Socio-semiotics of Objects. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter.

Vastokas, Joan

1992 Beyond the Artifact: Native Art as Performance. North York: Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies, York University.

Serge Gauthier, Charlevoix ou la création d'une région folklorique. Étude du discours de folkloristes québécois (1916-1980), Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 2006, 208 pages.

> Recenseur : Brad Loewen Université de Montréal

Serge Gauthier s'intéresse aux bases conceptuelles et méthodologiques du folklore québécois, à travers le travail de trois ethnologues dans la région de Charlevoix. Il trace l'évolution de leurs discours et en analyse l'effet identitaire sur la région à l'étude, tout en portant un regard critique sur le rôle des institutions ethnologiques québécoises. Cet examen des rapports entre le « peuple » et une certaine élite intellectuelle est des plus féconds. La discipline s'est structurée surtout à l'Université Laval, où l'ethnologie s'enseigne depuis 1944 au sein d'un département qui regroupe également l'histoire, l'archéologie et l'histoire de l'art. Le département héberge les Archives de folklore, une collection sonore remontant aux années 1920 et augmentée au fil des ans d'autres enregistrements de toute l'Amérique française. Les folkloristes du département ont bâti les structures de l'ethnologie québécoise au cours de XX^e siècle. Trois individus en particulier ont façonné la discipline : Marius Barbeau, Félix-Antoine Savard et Luc Lacourcière. Leurs discours permettent à l'auteur de décortiquer les bases de l'ethnologie québécoise, en approfondissant les notions de région, d'identité et des rapports entre mémoire et histoire.

L'auteur se penche d'abord sur la figure ambiguë de Marius Barbeau, le « grand sourcier » du folklore québécois. Originaire de la Beauce, formé à Oxford et influencé par Boas et l'école de Chicago, Barbeau est dévoilé sous les traits d'un intermédiaire qui transige entre le Canada français profond et une bourgeoisie anglo-américaine avide de connaissances sur les cultures et les paysages « primitifs » du continent nord-américain. Barbeau travaille alors comme folkloriste au Musée de l'Homme à Ottawa, un milieu anglo-canadien. De plus, il offre ses services à la société *Croisières du Saguenay* qui érige Charlevoix, sur la côte escarpée du Saint-Laurent entre Québec et le Saguenay, en destination touristique. L'auteur note que Barbeau paie ses informateurs à la pièce pour obtenir leur version des contes et des chansons traditionnelles, ce qui par-

achève ce portrait de l'anthropologue bien de son époque, complice avec les élites du moment et en rupture avec ses informateurs non instruits. Ce contexte historique n'empêche toutefois pas l'auteur de se distancier de la démarche de Barbeau et, comme enfant et citoyen de Charlevoix, de la construction figée que Barbeau et ses successeurs ont faite de la région. Des décennies après leur « folklorisation » par le célèbre anthropologue, la région et ses habitants en ressentent toujours les relents et, à travers ce livre, font enfin entendre leur réplique.

Parmi les concepts déterminants en ethnologie, au Québec ou ailleurs, se retrouve le cadre spatial d'étude. Le terme « région » revient souvent dans ce contexte et, au Québec, a acquis un sens identitaire que l'auteur examine en lien avec le Charlevoix « folklorisé ». La région a été conceptualisée comme une culture précise ancrée dans un espace précis, à l'image de la nation territoriale, idée empruntée elle-même au nationalisme européen du XIXe siècle. De plus, la région devait former un élément constitutif de la nation territoriale, intégrée à cette dernière par un ensemble de rapports hiérarchiques de culture et de pouvoir. Barbeau, au cours de sa trajectoire intellectuelle, attribue à la région le trait de primitivité. Au début de ses enquêtes en Charlevoix, il conceptualise la région francophone selon le modèle des réserves indiennes, ces îlots de culture « sauvage » qu'il a déjà étudiés. Lacourcière et Savard, élèves de Barbeau influencés par le nationalisme au Québec, situeront la région plus précisément dans un cadre québécois. Selon leur vision, la « région » s'insère à la nation territoriale du Québec comme une unité singularisée par la « pureté » de sa culture spécifique, puisée à une source française plus ou moins idéalisée, et par son opposition à Montréal l'« impure », la multiculturelle, la bilingue et la modernisante. Ainsi, la région entre dans l'identité d'un Québec situé désormais au carrefour de la tradition et de la modernité. De façon très opérante, le concept de région géoculturelle participe aussi à la construction touristique de plusieurs régions du Québec, et les ethnologues n'y sont pas en reste. La villégiature et le tourisme deviennent un vecteur par lequel l'ethnologie s'insère aux rapports symboliques entre le peuple, conçu comme étant immuable et fixé dans l'espace, et l'élite, conçue comme étant évolutive et mobile.

Alors que le concept de région peut s'appliquer à plusieurs terrains d'enquête, Charlevoix, selon Gauthier, semblait s'offrir comme un exemple parfait aux premiers folkloristes. Dès le début de son histoire, la région fut désignée comme un territoire « sauvage » : inhabitable, en raison de la pénurie de ses sols, et effrayant, en raison de ses coteaux abrupts qui se lèvent directement du Saint-Laurent. À sa colonisation au XVIIe siècle, la population éparse et francophone s'est concentrée à Baie-Saint-Paul, une échancrure dans le plateau montagneux où l'accostage et l'agriculture étaient du moins faisables. Plus tard, La Malbaie devint le siège d'une industrie forestière et d'une villégiature bourgeoise, ces deux moteurs de modernisation au Québec en dehors des basses terres agricoles. L'analyse de Gauthier est complexe et probante à l'égard des rup-

178 / Book Reviews / Comptes rendus

Anthropologica 50 (2008)